

Social and Legal Status of Women: A Comparative Intertextual Analysis

Nur Sapta Riskiawati^{1*}, Muh Fauzi Razak²

¹STIMIK Handayani Makassar, Indonesia

²Teaching staff of STIE Nobel, Indonesia

*Corresponding author

Nur Sapta Riskiawati

Article History

Received: 12.05.2018

Accepted: 28.05.2018

Published: 30.05.2018



Abstract: There is always possibility that one writer is inspired by another writer, especially if one particular writer is known to be a constant reader of another writer. This research addressed the intertextual relationship between two literary works, such as Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility* and Catherine Helen Spence's *Mr. Hogarth's Will* and elaborates the possibility whether Catherine Helen Spence's work was inspired by Jane Austen's works. This research employed descriptive qualitative method by applying intertextual and semantic analysis by Julia Kristeva that explains the connection between one literary work and other literary work. The data were collected from the novel *Sense and Sensibility* (1811) and *Mr. Hogarth's Will* (1865). The result of analysis showed that there are similarities in the two stories in terms of storyline and women characters that experience the same fate of not inheriting any heritage. In *Sense and Sensibility*, women characters do not get heritage based on Primogeniture law that applies in England, whilst in *Mr. Hogarth's Will*, the women characters do not get heritage based on will by their uncle. Evidence of transformation in the novel 'Mr. Hogarth's Will' from the novel 'Sense and Sensibility' has been the primary purpose of intertextual analysis. Transformation in the novel 'Sense and Sensibility' is concerned with women characters who merely accepted their fate, but in 'Mr. Hogarth's Will' women characters try their efforts of getting an appropriate job.

Keywords: social, legal status, intertextual analysis, semantic analysis.

INTRODUCTION

There is a difference between stealing another writer's work and being inspired by another writer's work. There is always possibility that one writer is inspired by another writer, especially if one particular writer is known to be a constant reader of another writer. In Barthes's *Theory of the Text*, he explains that texts do not really from their authors but actually from a plurality of voices and of other phrase and of other texts. Barthes proposes, the new textual practice can be marked by *signifiante*, an infinite dimension of meaning. 'It (the text) deconstructs the language of communication, representation or expression ... and reconstructs another language' [1]. Combinatorial capacities are infinite. He notes that 'one of the paths of this deconstruction reconstruction is to permute texts, scraps of texts that have existed or exist around and finally within the text being considered: any text is an intertext'.

This study used intertextuality analysis. It is used in describing the complex relationships in works of literature. Julia Kristeva was the first literary theorist who introduced the term of intertextuality which is to describe the way in which texts interact with each other.

This research analyzed two novels that have similarities and possibility to be analyzed through intertextuality principle, Jane Austen's novel *Sense and*

Sensibility and Catherine Helen Spence's novel *Mr. Hogarth's Will*.

A novel was as Jane Austen's first published work in 1811, under the pseudonym called "A Lady", was *Sense and Sensibility*. The unpublished original version of Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility* was in letters or epistolary form and entitled *Elinor and Marianne*. She later changed the form to narrative and changed the title to *Sense and Sensibility*. *Mr. Hogarth's Will* is a novel by Catherine Helen Spence which was first published in 1865.

Furthermore, the researcher chosen two novels and analyzed the similarities of the social legal status in this both novels. In the book *Catherine Helen Spence an Autobiography* by Catherine Helen Spence, she wrote that she often read Jane Austen's novels. She read and appreciated Jane Austen's novels 'About this time I read and appreciated Jane Austen's novels, those exquisite miniatures, which no doubt her contemporaries identified without much interest. Her circle was as narrow as mine, indeed, narrower ... So great a charm have Jane Austen's books had for me that I have made a practice of reading them through regularly once a year' [2]. This circumstance raised the assumption that Catherine Helen Spence's novel *Mr. Hogarth's Will* was inspired by Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility*. This is the reason why the researcher

will be using intertextuality by Julia Kristeva, to detect the similarities which could be found in the two novels and since these novels have the same theme which is about social and legal status of women, and how women characters must change their social classes because at that time women cannot inherit.

There are several studies that feature Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility* in its analysis as its object. One of them is a research written by Muftihaturrahman [3]. This thesis used sociological approach, she revealing that all woman characters in both of Austen's novel actually cannot accept the concept and the practice of primogeniture system. Another researcher is Santos [4]. Her thesis examined how Jane Austen's novels can be meaningful to women readers especially, because it focuses on the marriage plot and she uses Julia Kristeva intertextuality, to describe the relation of marriage among all of Jane Austen's novels. The researcher also found a thesis that compares two novels from intertextuality perspective. It is a research by Oosterik [5]. Her thesis explained modernist novel by Virginia Woolf *Mrs. Dalloway* and Michael Cunningham's creation *The Hours*. The novels and their characters are related to each other. She explored the relationship of two novels in this case how to define the relationship between modernism and postmodernism in literature.

The term Intertextuality is first coined by Julia Kristeva through her work in 1960s. Kristeva calls the process of entry forms or other words as *intertextualité*. In *The Bounded Text*, Kristeva States that any text is 'a permutation of texts, an intertextuality in a space of a given text, several utterances, taken from other texts, intersect and neutralise one another' [6]. In Graham Allen's *Intertextuality*, he notes that texts are seen as 'lacking in any kind of independent meaning [7]. Originally intertextuality proposed in the field of critical theory to surpass its boundaries and also has been occasionally used by linguists. Irwin pointed out that it 'has come to have almost as many meanings as users, from those faithful to Kristeva's original vision to those who simply use it as a stylish way of talking about allusion and influence' [8].

Kristeva also developed intertextuality from the ideas of Bakhtin's dialogism and heteroglossia. The former refers to the clash between the distinct characters' voices and languages, especially in novels or between the individual or personal and social meaning of pronunciation or words. Heteroglossia refers to the recognition of different 'languages' within society itself: that is 'languages' of different social, professional groups and classes, which have been termed 'registers' in sociolinguistics. Bakhtin's theory about social aspect is the strong link between Bakhtin's ideas and Kristeva's idea of intertextuality [9]. In *The Death of the Author* (1977), Barthes state that, the creator placing and controlling the meaning of the work.

Attaching primary importance to the name of the author allows for the work to become an item of exchange value. Furthermore, Barthes [10] stated that texts constitute a plurality of voices, an open and polysemous space, whose origin is the 'd  ja lu'. Kristeva perspective of semiology and how she introduced her new concept of semiotic called *s  manalyse* or in English called *semanalysis*.

In *semanalysis*, Kristeva revealed the dynamics of the signifying process or *significance*. The expression engendering the formula truly illustrates the motile nature of the signifier-emerging as text [11]. Spence's literary work was inspired by Austen's, but both of them are still two different writers and both of them had different life and social lives. Thus, it can be said that two works might have similarities but they also have differences, in this case Spence developed Austen's idea with her own social life and imagination, and the result of its own particularity is called *transformation text*.

METHODOLOGY

Type Research

This study is categorized as a descriptive qualitative research and for the analyzing of this work it used intertextuality and *semanalysis* by Julia Kristeva. This study focused on analyzing the intertextuality of two novels and through the related literary history, analyzed how Spence's novel seems to be inspired by Austen's novel and how a theme in a novel is reintroduced by another novel with some changes or modification.

Source of Data

In this research, the researcher used the general sources called primary and supporting data source. The primary data were collected from two novels, Jane Austen's *Sense and Sensibility* and Catherine Helen Spence's *Mr. Hogarth's Will* through the text. The supporting data were collected from the biography of Jane Austen and Catherine Helen Spence as the author of two novels, the various books and writings from the internet related to the subject matter of this research such as intertextuality and *semanalysis*, and also sources related to legal status system in England in the 19th century and in Australia.

METHOD OF COLLECTING DATA

The method of collecting data was determined as the most significant stage in completing this research. The researcher uses the library research method in collecting the various sources related to intertextuality and *semanalysis*. The researcher collected the data through the novel itself, the literary history, and the related scientific writing such as thesis, articles, and journals both from books and internet.

Research Procedure

The research procedure is an action of scientific exploration which is done by the researcher

carefully, systematically, accurately and uses the standard rule in the study to the object to be finished in a good result. Therefore, a research should be made with were clear and systematic procedure. The procedure was firstly read the text of the novel of Sense and Sensibility and Mr. Hogarth's Will in order to understand the story. Then, the researcher scoped the problems which have been identified. This stage is needed because the identified problems in the novel are still broad. After that, determining the basic theory or approach was used in analyzing the problems. In this case, the researcher decided to use intertextuality and semanalysis by Kristeva. Then, the researcher collected data and information about the topic from books, articles, and from internet. Finally, analyzing and describing the data by applying basic theory and approach which has been determined before.

FINDINGS

There are two parts of discussion in this chapter. The first part discusses about the social legal status of women characters in Sense and Sensibility. The second part is the social legal status of women characters found in the Mr. Hogarth's Will and the transformation or modification of the text from Sense and Sensibility to Mr. Hogarth's Will. In this intertextual analysis, the researcher found the similarities in Austen's Sense and Sensibility and Spence's Mr. Hogarth's Will in their social and legal status of women characters.

Social and Legal Status of Women Characters in Sense and Sensibility

In the beginning of the story of Sense and Sensibility, Jane Austen explained the Dashwood family as the owner of Norland Park in Sussex estate for many generations. In the nineteenth century when this novel was written and published, the law of England supported primogeniture system, specifically on how only the first son of the owner who could inherit the estate.

Mr. Henry Dashwood, the owner of Norland Park, had a son named John Dashwood from his first marriage, and he also has three daughters from his second marriage: Elinor, Marianne and Margaret Dashwood. His second wife and daughters are left with just little amount of money, and the estate of a Norland Park goes to his son, John Dashwood. The Dashwood women who are cast into a difficult situation, because none of them have money themselves, cannot inherit because they are women, and cannot earn a living either due to the values of the time which did not favour women from a respected a social class to work. In this story, the women are not legally entitled to own a property and they think this as a 'normal' and common thing in England at that time.

The death of Mr. Dashwood exempted his second wife and his three daughters from inheriting the state and the late's other fortune. This situation changed

the widow and daughters position in the social class. They did not belong anywhere in the high society or the highest class people with all the glamour life and the eligibility to have a successful marriage and wealthy husband.

From reading on this novel, people will realize that actually it tells the love story of the two elder characters of the Dashwood women, Elinor and Marianne. Marriage is the most logical solution for them, because they are old enough to get married and eventually they must find a husband with a good property. Facing the difficult financial condition and, at the same time, also the problem of finding the right man who could assure their life, Elinor and Marianne find themselves at a difficult situation. Edward Ferrars, Fanny's brother, the wife of her half-brother, has an eye on Elinor from the first time they meet. Edward is a pleasant and kind person. Although his sister and mother have great ambition from him, he is a very retiring sort and wants a quite life and peace instead. He is a very perfect match for Elinor who also admired him. In this marriage, the sensible attitude of the female character, in this case, Elinor, gains over romantic dream that a young women used to have. That at the end Elinor is not marrying a wealthy husband. Edward is actually supposed to inherit his mother wealth and state but his mother got disappointed due to the fact that, Edward decided to marry Elinor, to which Mrs. Ferrars is against, is the reason why Edward is not her heir anymore.

'She (Mrs. Jennings) was perfectly convinced of it. It would be an excellent match, for he was rich and she was handsome. Mrs. Jennings had been anxious to see colonel Brandon well married, ever since her connection with Sir John first brough him to her knowledge; and she was always anxious to get a good husband for every pretty girl.' [12]

This quotation explains how Colonel Brandon could be a solution for Marianne. Marianne at first thinks that Colonel Brandon is too old. But at the end of the story Colonel Brandon kindest makes Marianne finally accept him.

The Transformation of Social and Legal Status of Women Characters in Mr. Hogarth's Will

In this section, the researcher will explain the parts of Mr. Hogarth's Will which seems to have some similarities with same elements in Sense and Sensibility. Since this research is an intertextual analysis, the researcher will also explain the transformation that occurs in the more recent text, namely. There are some similarities in both novels, but there are also some differences that can be seen in the transformation of the text.

In the novel Mr. Hogarth's Will, the story begins right after the death of Mr. Hogarth, the wealthy man who owns Cross Hall, who left a will and was to be read by his lawyer. In the will, Mr. Hogarth explain that all of his property legacy included Cross Hall estate will be given to his son from his private marriage with Elizabeth Ormistown.

'To Francis Ormistown, otherwise Hogarth, at present head clerk in the Bank of Scotland, who is my son by a private irregular marriage contracted with Elizabeth Ormistown, on the ninth day of July, 18- , and who is my heir-at-law' [13]

From the beginning, Mr. Hogarth thought that men and women could have an equal position and right if women had a proper education, so he decided to give a proper male education to Jane and Alice Melville as his beloved nieces from his sister Mary Hogarth, who had been dead for fifteen years. In his will, he explained the reasons why he only gave very little inheritance to both of his nieces, which was twelve pounds a year each for each of them for three years.

After the death of their uncle, they had only one month to stay in the Cross Hall, and within a month they had to have a job and a place to stay. As what Mr. Hogarth expected them could do, Jane and Elsie started to look for a suitable job based on education that they already had. Unfortunately, at that time, it was not easy for women to get a decent job. Jane started looking for a job in one of the banks in Scotland, but her status as a woman became an obstacle to get accepted even though she had a proper education.

'I admire your spirit, Miss Melville. If one thing cannot be accomplished you must try another. But in an establishment like this, you see, I could not possibly take you in. a private employer might admire your undoubted ability; but I am responsible to a Board of Directors, and they would decidedly oppose such an innovation. Your sex, you are aware, are not noted for powers of secrecy. I dare say it is a prejudice; but bank directors and bank customers have prejudices and no one likes any additional chance of having affairs made public' [13]

After having heard the problems of Jane, Peggy decided to invite Jane to come with her to Edinburgh and leaving from Swinton. At first Jane was reluctant, but because Jane did not have a place to stay and she had to leave the Cross Hall immediately. Thus, Jane and Elsie followed Peggy to stay in Edinburgh.

Jane and Elsie had to face the transformation in their social class, before they moved; their social status was quite high, due to the fact that they lived in

the Cross Hall, one of the best states in their area, and his uncle's status as one of the most honored people in Swinton. So when Jane and Elsie stayed at Peggy's home in Edinburgh, Scotland, they had to do something that they never did before.

At first, Elsie felt that marriage could be a solution for them. Because they did not have any experience and were confused where to start their new live. But Jane felt that this was not what their uncle expected them to do, how their uncle had an expectations how they both could use their education and knowledge and that could make them independent persons. Francis was very interested in Jane, but because the will by Mr. Hogarth how Francis will lose all of his estate when he married one of his cousins and Mr. Hogarth also thought that marriage of such near relations being mischievous and improper. Because of his love to Jane, Francis decided to left all of his estate to marry Jane. There was a rich gentleman name Mr. Brandon, Peggy's friend from Australia who really liked her When Mr. Brandon went to Edinburgh, he proposed to Elsie. The truth was he really loved her, and he also thought that he could help and saved Elsie from her cruel situation, and he wanted to ask Elsie to come with him to Australia. However, Elsie rejected the proposal of Mr. Brandon because he thought that his idea to propose her was actually based on the feeling pity to her.

DISCUSSION

The research focused on the intertextual analysis and explained there is intertextuality in the novels *Sense and Sensibility* and *Mr. Hogarth's Will*. In this research, the researcher assumed that *Mr. Hogarth's Will* Spence's literary work is inspired by the already existed literary work which is Austen's *Sense and Sensibility*. Therefore, even though Spence's literary work was inspired by Austen's, but both of them are still two different writers and had different life and social lives. Thus, it can be said that two works might have similarities but they also have differences, in this case Spence developed Austen's idea with her own social life and imagination, and the result of its own particularity is called transformation text. The researcher analyzed both novels and sees the connection in two literary works, *Sense and Sensibility* which was published earlier in 1811 and *Mr. Hogarth's will* that published in 1865. There are several factors that distinguished that novel. They are when the social changes happened to them. Based on the year of publishing, this might prove that *Sense and Sensibility* and *Mr. Hogarth's will* is not the same work but transformation of the work that published before.

The researcher read both Spence's *Mr. Hogarth's Will* and Austen's *Sense and Sensibility*, and it makes the researcher recognize the similarity of both novels. Therefore, the researcher decided to analyze the similarity between these two texts and see the

transformation that happened from one text to the other text.

CONCLUSION

After explaining about the two novels from different authors, an English novel *Sense and Sensibility* by Austen and an Australian writer Spence with her novel *Mr. Hogarth's Will* using Kristeva's intertextuality and Semanalysis by seeking relations that exist in two novels, the researcher concluded that there are intertextual relation in two novels Austen's *Sense and Sensibility* and Spence's *Mr. Hogarth's Will*. The intertextuality in two novels can be seen from the theme, about social and legal status of women that already discussed by the researcher, how the two female characters in both novels do receive inheritance, which gives impact to their social status changed, so they have to live in a very different way. Since the researcher has been found so many analysis of Austen's novel *Sense and Sensibility*, thus the researcher advised to the reader to analyze the novel from Spence's *Mr. Hogarth's Will*. The novel from Spence *Mr. Hogarth's Will* has many aspects that can be analyzed. It is certainly interesting to be discussed by further researches. This novel has a lot of themes and it can be associated with many theories and can be analyze and find the relevant problems that still exist around us, such as politics, economics, gender, and other social problems. The researcher also suggest that the other researcher could use intertextuality approach to see the relation between two literary works and explain how author can inspire another author in their work.

REFERENCES

1. Young R, editor. *Untying the text: A post-structuralist reader*. Boston: Routledge & Kegan Paul; 1981.
2. Magarey S. *Unbridling the tongues of women: a biography of Catherine Helen Spence*. University of Adelaide Press; 2010.
3. Muftihaturrahman B. *The Impacts of Promogeniture System Toward Women as Revealed in Pride and Prejudice and Sense and Sensibility by Jane Austen*, Hasanuddin University, Thesis, 2015.
4. SANTOS ML. *A Truth Universally Acknowledged?:(Post) Feminist Rewritings of Austen's Marriage Plot* (Doctoral dissertation).
5. Oosterik EJ. *On buying flowers and other (not so) ordinary events. An intertextual analysis of Mrs. Dalloway and The Hours* (Master's thesis).
6. Kristeva J. *Desire in language: A semiotic approach to literature and art*. Columbia University Press; 1980.
7. Allen G. *Intertextuality*. Routledge; 2011 May 27.
8. Irwin W. *Against intertextuality. Philosophy and literature*. 2004;28(2):227-42.
9. Kristeva J. *A new type of intellectual: the dissident. The Kristeva Reader*. 1986; 292:300.
10. Barthes R. *S/Z*, Paris, Seuil. 1970.
11. Kristeva J. *Towards semiology of paragrams. The Tel Quel Reader*. 1998:25-49.
12. Austen J. *Sense and Sensibility*, London, Oxford University, 1811.
13. Spence CH. *MR. Hogarth's Will*, University of Sydney Library. 1865.